

MINUTES OF THE
MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS
AIR QUALITY TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING

Wednesday, November 10, 1999
MAG Office
Phoenix, Arizona

MEMBERS PRESENT

Dick Bowers, City of Scottsdale, Chairman	David Martin, Associated General Contractors
*Bill Bates, City of Avondale	*Connie Wilhelm-Garcia, Homebuilders Association of Central Arizona
Jim Weiss for Patrice Kraus, City of Chandler	*H. Maynard Blumer, American Institute of Architects- Central Arizona
*Danielle Typinski, Town of Gilbert	*Peter Allard, Valley Forward
Benjamin Johnson for Doug Kukino, City of Glendale	*Ian Calkins, Phoenix Chamber of Commerce
Christine Zielonka, City of Mesa	*Monica Pastor, University of Arizona - Cooperative Extension
Joe Gibbs for Gaye Knight, City of Phoenix	*Tom Russell, Arizona Nursery Association
Mike Short for Mary O'Conner, City of Tempe	Pat Cupell for Stephanie Bondeson, Arizona Department of Transportation
Walter Bouchard, Citizen Representative	Peter Hyde for Randy Sedlacek, Arizona Department of Environmental Quality
*Arve Dahl, Citizen Representative	Jo Crumbaker, Maricopa County Environmental Services Department
David Feuerherd, Arizona Lung Association	Mark Ellery for Dennis Ehrhart, Arizona Department of Weights and Measures
*Bobbi Sparrow for W. Knox Ramsey, Jr., Arizona Automobile Dealers Association	Edward Stillings for Dennis Mittelstedt, Federal Highway Administration
*Greg Witherspoon, Salt River Project	*Judi Nelson, Arizona State University
Gary Young for Brian O'Donnell, Southwest Gas Corporation	*James Klinker, Arizona Farm Bureau
Jim Mikula for Scott Davis, Arizona Public Service Company	Jeremy Phillips for B. Bobby Ramirez, Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community
Charlie Stevens for Gina Grey, Western States Petroleum Association	David Rueckert, Citizen Representative
Bryan Jungwirth, Regional Public Transportation Authority	
Dave Berry, Arizona Motor Transport Association	
Jeannette Fish for Michael Kidd, Maricopa County Farm Bureau	
*Samuel Aubrey, Arizona Rock Products Association	

*Those members were neither present nor represented by proxy.

OTHERS PRESENT

Allan Kosecki, Maricopa Association of Governments	Gaye Knight, City of Phoenix
Dean Giles, Maricopa Association of Governments	Lindy Bauer, Maricopa Association of Governments
Cari Anderson, Maricopa Association of Governments	Tom Moore, Arizona Department of Environmental Quality
Andrea Martincic, Tosco	Hart Moore, Griffin Industries, Inc.
Larry Hawke, Pinal County Air Quality	Mary Jo Pitzl, Arizona Republic
Cathy Arthur, Maricopa Association of Governments	Mike Tunnell, WHI
Sandra Gilbert, Arizona Department of Transportation	Dan Shein, Arizona House of Representatives Staff
	Larry D. Person, City of Scottsdale
	Jennifer Anderson, Center for Law in the Public Interest
	William C. "Blue" Crowley, Citizen

1. Call to Order

A meeting of the Maricopa Association of Governments (MAG) Air Quality Technical Advisory Committee (AQTAC) was conducted on Wednesday, November 10, 1999. Dick Bowers, City of Scottsdale, Chairman, began a discussion of the agenda items at 1:30 p.m. since a quorum was not present.

3. PM-10 Certified Street Sweeper Study Update

This item was presented out of order since a quorum was not present. Dean Giles, MAG, provided a summary of the South Coast Air Quality Management District (SCAQMD) efforts to certify PM-10 efficient street sweepers. Next steps include an evaluation of PM-10 efficient street sweepers on local conditions in Maricopa County. Mr. Giles distributed a handout listing the SCAQMD certified street sweepers.

4. Brown Cloud Project

Mr. Bowers indicated that a quorum was now present. He then called the meeting to order. This item was presented out of order. Cari Anderson, MAG, informed the Air Quality Technical Advisory Committee that the presentation was similar to the October 25, 1999 public workshop presentation on the Brown Cloud. Ms. Anderson provided background information and the importance of historical data in understanding the trends and composition of urban haze.

Allan Kosecki, MAG, explained the source and composition of pollutants relating to the Brown Cloud. Dave Berry, Arizona Motor Transport Association, questioned the use of data from the Denver study since it is from a higher altitude. Mr. Berry understood higher altitudes contribute to the formation of increased levels of elemental carbon. Mr. Kosecki indicated that the chemical composition, not mass, from the Denver study was used in the Brown Cloud report.

Mr. Berry sought explanation regarding the background measurement obtained from the General Motors Proving Ground in the Arizona Department of Environmental Quality study. In comparison to other urban locations in Maricopa County, the elemental carbon was thought to be high. It was mentioned that the location of the General Motors Proving Ground was in fact in the urban area of southeast Mesa.

Ms. Anderson finished the presentation with a review of potential control measures identified in the Brown Cloud Report, a tentative schedule for MAG committee review, and a proposed recommendation for Air Quality Technical Advisory Committee consideration.

David Martin, Associated General Contractors, asked about the methodology for compiling the inventory. Ms. Anderson stated that the serious area PM-10 plan identified combustion sources, which are assumed to be PM-2.5 emissions. In addition, the nonroad engine and vehicle emission study (NEVES) produced by the Environmental Protection Agency was used. Mr. Martin asked if the resource materials were available.

Jo Crumbaker, Maricopa County Environmental Services Department, responded that the document was available. Ms. Crumbaker indicated that the NEVES surveyed manufacturers, activity levels, and economic indicators for 28 metro areas.

Peter Hyde, Arizona Department of Environmental Quality (ADEQ), stated that the Brown Cloud Report was an excellent PM-2.5 study, however, a shortcoming is that it lacks an analysis of extinction degradations. Also, a full understanding of seasonal variations is still not known. Furthermore, it was emphasized that the consultant needed to include in the Report a benefit/cost analyses for each control measure. Mr. Hyde moved that MAG staff work with the consultant to complete the Brown Cloud Report. The motion was seconded by Charlie Stevens, Western States Petroleum Association.

David Feurherd, Arizona Lung Association, indicated he did not understand the delay in the approval of this report. Mr. Feurherd mentioned several PM-10 reports completed in the Maricopa County nonattainment area and summarized that it was time to advance this study. Walter Bouchard, Citizen Representative, cited statistics referring to the detrimental contribution of particulate matter to public health and called for approval of the Brown Cloud Report as presented.

Mr. Stevens agreed with the need for a cost benefit analysis, particularly when approaching the Arizona Legislature with additional control measures. Mr. Feurherd suggested ADEQ provide the additional analyses needed for legislative inquiries. Joe Gibbs, City of Phoenix, concurred with this assessment stating that a cost benefit analysis was not a focus of the study and added that ADEQ should conduct any additional research.

Mr. Hyde indicated that seasonal variations were important to understanding what measures might need to be implemented in order to make a reduction in the urban haze perceptible to humans. Christine Zielonka, City of Mesa, indicated she concurs with the Arizona Lung Association and supports the need to decrease the harmful health effects from diesel emissions. William "Blue" Crowley commented on the growth of transportation in the metro area which leads to a polluted environment. Mr. Bowers called for a vote on the motion to recommend MAG staff complete work on the Brown Cloud Report with the consultant by including aspects of seasonal variation, source contribution, and benefit/cost analyses. The motion failed with no affirming votes.

Mr. Gibbs moved that the Air Quality Technical Advisory Committee recommend approval of the 1999 Brown Cloud Project for the Maricopa Association of Governments Area with a request that potential implementing entities consider the control measures for implementation, if feasible. Ms. Zielonka seconded and the motion passed with one no vote and one abstention.

Lindy Bauer, MAG, briefed the Air Quality Technical Advisory Committee on the news received this week from the Environmental Protection Agency. In a letter dated November 9, 1999 to Governor Hull, the EPA indicated it will not approve the Serious Area PM-10 Plan for the Maricopa County Nonattainment Area and outlined the dates for invoking sanctions in Maricopa County if deficiencies in the plan are not addressed. A copy of the correspondence from EPA was provided to the Committee.

2. Approval of the October 13, 1999 Meeting Minutes

The Committee reviewed the minutes from the October 13, 1999 meeting. Mr. Bouchard, indicated that in error he was not listed in the October 13, 1999 minutes as being present. Mr. Mittelstedt moved, and Ms. Zielonka seconded, and it was unanimously carried to approve the minutes with corrections from the October 13, 1999 meeting.

5. Air Quality Contingency Projects

Ms. Anderson explained that the FY 2000-2004 MAG Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) has \$1.4 million reserved for air quality contingency projects in fiscal year 2001. Two options were proposed to the Air Quality Technical Advisory Committee for using the contingency funds: accelerate projects already programmed in FY 2002 or identify new projects for funding from the list of projects submitted to the Transportation Review Committee for the FY 2001-2005 TIP. A handout was provided to the AQTAC describing eligible CMAQ projects for advancement and street projects with estimated emissions reduction. Ms. Anderson stated that the staff recommendation is to program the contingency for Phase 3 of the Maricopa County dirt road paving program.

Clarification was sought by Mr. Berry on the acceleration of this project in relation to the programming activities of the Transportation Review Committee.

Ms. Bauer indicated that staff has been conducting model runs to determine feasibility of control measures. The priority given by the Air Quality Technical Advisory Committee has been for air quality projects. In addition, the Transportation Review Committee has not completed drafting recommendations for updating the FY 2001-2005 MAG Transportation Improvement Program. Ms. Anderson added that recommendations from staff will likely contain projects for the paving of unpaved roads.

Mr. Feuerherd moved and David Rueckert, Citizen Representative, seconded, and it was unanimously carried to recommend \$1.4 million in contingency for funding project MMAFED-01 in FY 2001 for the Phase 3 paving of dirt roadways in unincorporated Maricopa County.

6. Call to the Public

An opportunity was provided to members of the public to address the Air Quality Technical Advisory Committee. Mr. Crowley indicated that the Vision 2025 public meetings scheduled this week provide an opportunity to offer concerns and comments.

7. Next Committee Meeting

Mr. Bowers announced that the next meeting of the AQTAC may be scheduled if necessary.

With no further business, the meeting was adjourned.